EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

STILL LEFT

How Exclusion In California's Colleges & Universities Continues To Hurt Our Values, Students, and Democracy



ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We want to express our sincere gratitude to our funders for their support in making this report and our efforts possible, including: The Angell Foundation, Ascendium Education Solutions, Inc., The Ballmer Group, The Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation, The California Community Foundation, The College Futures Foundation, The ECMC Foundation, The Evelyn and Walter Haas Jr. Fund, The Kresge Foundation, The Leonard Hill Charitable Trust, The Lumina Foundation, The Marin Community Foundation, The Morris and Mayer Kaplan Family Foundation, The Molina Family Foundation, The Rosalinde and Arthur Gilbert Foundation, Sobrato Philanthropies, Southern California Edison, The Stuart Foundation, and The Skyline Foundation. Their investment in the Campaign for College Opportunity has allowed us to make a significant impact in ensuring all Californians have an equal opportunity to attend and succeed in higher education.

The Campaign for College Opportunity is grateful for the involvement, expertise, and guidance of our reviewers Dr. Estela Bensimon and Dr. Edward Bush. To the students, faculty, and college administrators who shared their insights on the question of leadership in California's public colleges and universities, and the impact that our 2018 report had in raising attention to this conversation on their campuses, thank you for your encouragement and support for this update. We are especially grateful to Dr. Luke Wood and Dr. Frank Harris whose complimentary brief, *Equity-Minded Faculty Hiring Practices: Promoting Fairness, Inclusion and Faculty Diversity that Support Student Success in Higher Education*, provides college leaders with the necessary tools to advance a more equitable hiring process. We would also like to thank David Drummer and our team of graduate research fellows, Douglas H. Lee, Idalys Perez, Brianna Ramirez, Lupe Salome Renteria, Stephanie Sowl, Kendall Wulbrun, Paula Nazario, Jennifer Nazario, and Jose Aguilar, who provided critical research assistance, examining thousands of websites and membership rosters to collect, validate, and analyze the data for this report. A special thank you to Colleen Moore, Jessie Ryan, and Molly McGuire, who provided a review of statewide funded investments and initiatives to increase diversity in our public higher education systems.

Vikash Reddy, Ph.D., was the primary author of this report with significant contributions and support from Michele Siqueiros.

Errata: The original version of this report incorrectly identified the racial/ethnic background of the president of California State University, Los Angeles. We have corrected all analyses related to campus-level leadership at the California State University system. The author and research team deeply regret the error.

STILL LEFT OUT: HOW EXCLUSION IN CALIFORNIA'S COLLEGES & UNIVERSITIES CONTINUES TO HURT OUR VALUES, STUDENTS AND DEMOCRACY

Home to the nation's largest Latinx (15 million), Asian American and Native Hawaiian/Pacific Islander (NHPI) (almost 7 million), and the fifth largest Black (2.8 million) populations, California is our nation's most diverse and populous state. **Today, Latinx, Black, Asian American and NHPI, and American Indian/Alaska Native** (AIAN) Californians account for 61% of our state's population and 67% of our undergraduate student body, and that share is projected to grow.¹ This diversity is one of the state's greatest assets, yet, as Dr. Estela Mara Bensimon notes in her preface to the full report, representation of racially and ethnically minoritized faculty in California's colleges and universities is "embarrassingly low, particularly in comparison to the racial composition of the student body."

Nearly two in three Californians are Latinx, Black, Asian American and NHPI.



Figure 1. California Population by Race/Ethnicity.

*Native Hawaiian and Pacific Islander Data Source: U.S. Census Bureau, American Community Survey, 2021



Two in three public undergraduates are Latinx, Black, Asian American and NHPI.



Figure 2. California Public Undergraduates by Race/Ethnicity, 2021-2022.

*Native Hawaiian and Pacific Islander Data Source: Data retrieved from individual system dashboards/data repositories

How is this the case? The simple answer is that—despite efforts to improve representation and invest in diversity, equity, and inclusion—transformational change to achieve equity and inclusion has not occurred. In this updated analysis of representation by race/ethnicity and gender among community college and public university faculty, academic senate bodies, college leaders, and governing boards, we find these bodies remain unreflective of the diversity of California and its student body.

While representation among Latinx, Black, and Asian American and NHPI Californians has increased at almost every level of leadership across the University of California (UC), the California State University (CSU), and the California Community Colleges, **institutional and system leadership remains dominated by white men.**

In 2018, the Campaign for College Opportunity published <u>Left Out: How Exclusion in California's Colleges</u> and Universities Hurts Our Values, Our Students, and Our Economy, which documented the severe demographic mismatch between the state's population; the student bodies in our public colleges and universities; and our higher education leaders and faculty at the institutional, district, and system levels.² This report reexamines the issue of representation in leadership across California's public colleges and universities. We are disappointed that while some progress has been made, the governing bodies, leadership bodies, and faculties of the UC, CSU, and the California Community Colleges still do not reflect our people, our values, or our promise. Five years later, one thing is clear: California's Black, Latinx, underrepresented Asian American and NHPI, and AIAN residents and scholars are *Still Left Out*.

An equitable and inclusive California higher education system will benefit all Californians. **The UC, the CSU, and the California Community Colleges must lead the way by both educating and employing a workforce that includes Californians from all racial and ethnic backgrounds.** To this end, our colleges and universities must intentionally focus on supporting Latinx, Black, underrepresented Asian American and NHPI, and AIAN students to enroll in college and complete their degrees, designing educational pathways that guarantee students the right to enroll in transfer-level courses taught by diverse faculty on campuses that are welcoming for all students. If California is to maintain its position as an economic and political leader, we must ensure the state's public colleges and universities enroll students in a more equitable fashion, supporting them with faculty and leaders that share their backgrounds, have a track record in effectively supporting students from all backgrounds, and are committed to their success.

THE GOOD NEWS:

- Appointments to the UC Board Regents, the CSU Board of Trustees, the California Community Colleges Board of Governors, and the California Student Aid Commission have helped diversify these bodies over the past five years.
- The UC has improved representation of Black Californians among its system- and campuslevel leaders.
- Black faculty account for six percent of both tenured and non-tenured faculty at the California Community Colleges, and Black Californians are well-represented among system-, district-, and campus-level leadership.
- The share of tenured and tenure-track professors who are women has grown from 33% to 40% at the UC, and from 47% to 49% at the CSU.
- Among UC faculty, 18% of tenured/tenure-track faculty and 26% of non-tenured faculty are Asian American and NHPI.
- About half of CSU presidents are women, and women account for 50% of campus senior leaders and more than half of the CSU Board of Trustees.
- About half (11 of 23) CSU campuses are led by Latinx, Black, Asian American, or NHPI presidents.
- Women lead 52 of the 116 community college campuses.
- Forty-nine percent (57 of 116) community college presidents come from diverse backgrounds.
- At the UC, the CSU, and the California Community Colleges, Latinx, Black, Asian American and NHPI, and AIAN professors account for a larger share of tenured and tenure-track faculty in 2021 compared to 2017, though these gains were limited at all three systems.

THE BAD NEWS:

Latinx, Black, Asian American and NHPI, and AIAN professors at the UC (29%), the CSU (34%), and the California Community Colleges (35%) are underrepresented among tenured and tenure-track faculty bodies.

- Only seven percent (eight of 117) of senior campus leaders at the UC campuses are Latinx, despite the fact that 25% of UC students, 39% of all Californians, and 49% of young Californians (18 to 24-years old) are Latinx.
- Only two of the nine undergraduate UC campuses are led by women.
- Latinx faculty members are woefully underrepresented at all three public community college and university systems, comprising only eight percent of tenured/tenure-track faculty members at the UC, 10% at the CSU, and 18% at the California Community Colleges.
- Asian American and NHPI students make up 14% of California's community college students, but only eight percent of campus- and district-level leaders, and only 11% of tenured and 10% non-tenured faculty at community colleges—levels that have barely changed in five years.
- Only four percent of CSU tenured/tenure-track faculty and only three percent of UC tenured/ tenure-track faculty are Black.
- Seventy percent of the Academic Senate of the CSU and 64% of the campuswide academic senate members are white, despite white students only making up 21% of the CSU's undergraduate student body.

As our leaders seek diversity, they must commit to being equity-minded and to placing a priority on creating a more inclusive campus environment for our faculty and student bodies.

The demographic mismatch between the state population, student population, and leadership population means that students from Latinx, Black, underrepresented Asian American and NHPI, and AIAN backgrounds have fewer role models, advisors, and mentors who share their experiences.

Research indicates that minoritized students see meaningful educational benefits when exposed to teachers or instructors of their own racial/ethnic background,³ with studies finding higher pass rates, higher grades, and greater likelihood of re-enrolling in the discipline when matched with a same-race instructor.⁴ Students who have faculty with similar backgrounds to serve as role models also tend to set higher career aspirations for themselves⁵ and experience a greater sense of belonging and social integration.⁶

Research from multiple different domains has catalogued the benefits of diversity in decision-making bodies or executive teams, where multiple perspectives bring fresh ideas.⁷ The research and data make clear what we have known for some time: we must work to ensure that our public colleges and universities reflect the state's diversity in their student bodies, faculties, and leadership bodies so that the next generation of students to attend college can enjoy the full benefits of their college experiences and complete their degrees.



PUBLIC HIGHER EDUCATION IN CALIFORNIA

Collectively, our three public higher education systems in California enroll roughly 2.5 million students per year.⁸ Of California's 147 public colleges and universities, 132 have a designation as a Hispanic-Serving Institution (HSI), meaning at least 25% of their student body is Latinx, and the remaining 15 campuses are "emerging" HSIs (more than 15% of the student body is Latinx).⁹ Among the public colleges and universities in the state, 68 qualify as Asian American and Native American Pacific Islander-Serving Institutions (AANAPISIs) meaning that at least 10% of the student body is Asian American, Native American, or Pacific Islander, and at least half of the students enrolled are eligible for federal financial aid such as the Pell Grant.¹⁰ As system-specific data presented in this report makes clear, the state's Black and Latinx students are disproportionately enrolled in community colleges in the state.

Latinx students make up nearly half of the student body at the CSU and California Community Colleges, but only a quarter at the UC.



Figure 3. Undergraduate Population by Race/Ethnicity (2021-2022).

*Native Hawaiian and Pacific Islander

California Population (18-24)

Undergraduate Enrollment California State University

Undergraduate Enrollment California Community College

Undergraduate Enrollment

University of California

Data Source: U.S. Census Bureau, American Community Survey, 2021; Data retrieved from individual system dashboards/data repositories

7

The California Community Colleges is the closest at reflecting California's diversity in its student body with the CSU not far behind. The UC meanwhile, is falling far short of ensuring the full inclusion of Black and especially Latinx Californians among the student body.

At all three systems, white faculty make up a majority of all tenured/tenure-track faculty members. Latinx faculty are the most consistently underrepresented, while Black faculty are underrepresented at the UC and CSU, and Asian American and NHPI faculty are underrepresented at the California Community Colleges.

Over half of tenured/tenure-track faculty at all three systems are white.

Figure 4. Tenured/Tenure-Track Faculty by Race/Ethnicity (Fall 2021).



Over half of campus senior leadership is white at all three systems.

Figure 5. Campus Senior Leadership by Race/Ethnicity.



Data Source: Data collected and analyzed by Campaign for College Opportunity researchers

Over half of campus senior leadership members at all three systems are white. At the UC, two thirds of the faculty are white. Latinx representation rates are particularly low, as the share, as shown in Figure 5, of Latinx undergraduates is more than double their representation at the senior leadership level across all systems. On a more positive note, Black representation in senior leadership is strong.

Systemwide academic senate bodies lack the diversity and inclusion of Latinx, Black, Asian American and NHPI members, with whites accounting for around 60-70% of members.

Academic senates at all three systems are overwhelmingly white.

Figure 6. Academic Senates by Race/Ethnicity.



Women account for half of tenured/tenure-track faculty members and senior leadership members at both the California Community Colleges and CSU. The UC lags behind on both fronts with women only making up 40% and 45% tenured/tenure track faculty or senior leaders respectively. More work is still needed to achieve full gender parity in these institutions at the UC.

Only four in 10 of tenured/tenure-track faculty at the UC are women.

Figure 7. Tenured/Tenure-Track Faculty by Gender.



Data Source: National Center for Education Statistics, Integrated Postsecondary Readiness System (IPEDS), 2021

UC lags behind the other systems in gender parity for campus senior leadership.

Figure 8. Campus Senior Leadership by Gender.



Data Source: Data collected and analyzed by Campaign for College Opportunity researchers

Latinx Californians are significantly underrepresented in the governing bodies of our public higher education systems and on the California Student Aid Commission (CSAC), with whites making up 40% or more of the memberships of the governing bodies for the UC, CSU, and California Community Colleges.

Whites are overrepresented in leadership positions within the UC, CSU, and community colleges governing boards.

Figure 9. Leadership Diversity Across Higher Education.



*Native Hawaiian and Pacific Islander

Data Source: Data collected and analyzed by Campaign for College Opportunity researchers



UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA

The UC is the state's premier research university, enrolling 230,407 undergraduate students across its nine campuses in fall 2022.¹¹ At a broad level, the Latinx undergraduate population at the UC still does not match the share of the state's 18 to 24-year-old population that is Latinx or the share of the California Latinx population overall.

Three out of four (76%) students at the UC are students of diverse racial and ethnic backgrounds, but individuals from these backgrounds account for less than half of all leadership and faculty at the UC.

Figure 10. UC populations by Race/Ethnicity (2021-2022).

California Population Total (39 M) California Population 18-24 (647,602) Undergraduate Population** (230,529) Board of Regents (18) Office of President (14) Campus Senior Leadership (117) Tenured/Tenure-Track Faculty (10,281) Non-Tenure-Track Faculty (6,384) Recent Tenured/Tenure-Track Hires (6,159) Part-Time Faculty (4,318) Assembly of the Academic Senate (71) Sum of Campus Academic Senates (2,053)



*Native Hawaiian and Pacific Islander

**Fall 2021 enrollment

Data Source: Data for population from US Census, undergraduate enrollment from system dashboards, faculty from IPEDS, other data from research team analyses

Note: This is Figure 2 in the full report

As is clear from Figure 10, Latinx Californians are underrepresented among the student body and at every level of UC leadership. Latinx Californians account for nearly half of the state's young population, but only a quarter of the UC student body is Latinx. Latinx leaders comprise only 22% of the UC Regents, with only one of 14 (seven percent) executive leaders in the UC Office of the President being Latinx.

We were additionally struck by a disturbing trend in how campus leadership positions are being filled. In 2018, just 11% of campus senior leadership positions were held by Latinx individuals. Over the last five years, that number has decreased. A mere seven percent of campus senior leadership in the 2021-2022 academic year was Latinx. Correspondingly, only eight percent of tenured/tenure-track faculty and 7% of non-tenured faculty were Latinx. Table 1 illustrates the discrepancies across racial groups throughout leadership in the system.

The UC's governing bodies overrepresent white leaders and significantly underrepresent Latinx, Asian American and NHPI leaders.

	Latinx	Black	Asian American and NHPI*	Other	Unknown	White
Board of Regents	4	2	3			9
Office of the President	1	3	1			9
Campus Leadership	8	17	15	1		76

Table 1. UC Governing Bodies by Race/Ethnicity.

*Native Hawaiian and Pacific Islander

Data Source: Data collected and analyzed by Campaign for College Opportunity researchers Note: Regents Data is as of 2023, UCOP and Campus Leadership as of 2021-2022 Campus senior leadership is hardly the only area where white members are significantly overrepresented relative to other racial/ethnic groups. Over two-thirds of the systemwide Assembly of the Academic Senate (68%) are white, as are 67% of members of the system's various campus-level academic senate bodies.

At the faculty level, white educators make up an overwhelming majority, even though white students account for only 21% of the student body. That said, professors from diverse racial/ethnic backgrounds account for a greater percentage of faculty today as compared to our 2018 analysis. Today, 60% of tenure-track faculty are white, down from 65% in 2017, and 53% of non-tenure-track faculty are white, down from 65% previously.

Overall, UC students have only 802 tenured or tenure-track Latinx and 356 Black professors leading their classes out of over 10,000 tenured or tenure-track faculty members across the system.

The vast majority of tenured/tenure-track UC faculty are white, with the number of Latinx, Black, Asian American and NHPI faculty increasing slightly since 2017.



Figure 11. Tenured/Tenure-Track Faculty at the UC by Race/Ethnicity (2017-2021).

*Native Hawaiian and Pacific Islander Data Source: National Center for Education Statistics, Integrated Postsecondary Readiness System (IPEDS) Note: This is Figure 3 in the full report

Women at the UC

Across the UC, women account for 54% of the student population. However, when looking at both campus and leadership, women are underrepresented in every category.

Despite accounting for more than half (54%) of undergraduate students, women are underrepresented at every UC leadership level, especially among tenure-track faculty (40%).

Figure 12. UC Populations by Gender (2021-2022).



*Fall 2021 enrollment

[†]Other/unknown includes nonbinary individuals and data not reported or unknown

Data Source: Data for population from US Census, undergraduate enrollment from system dashboards, faculty from IPEDS, other data from research team analyses

Note: This is Figure 4 in the full report



Of the nine UC campus chancellors, only two are women. Since the UC was founded in 1868, only 13 campus chancellors have been women, compared to 84 men. Only one has been a woman of color.¹²

At the faculty level, the share of tenured and tenure-track professors who are women grew between 2017 and 2021, **but still only four out of every ten tenure-track UC professors are women**.

UC BRIGHT SPOTS:

- Seventy-six percent of students at the UC are students of diverse racial and ethnic backgrounds.
- Black Californians are strongly represented across system- and campus-level leaders.

UC INCLUSION CHALLENGES:

- Over two-thirds of the systemwide Assembly of the Academic Senate and members of the system's various campus-level academic senate bodies are white.
- Latinx and Black students are underrepresented in the UC student body.
- Only 31% of tenured faculty are Latinx, Black, Asian American and NHPI, AIAN, or multiracial.
- Women are underrepresented at every UC leadership level, especially among tenure-track faculty. Only 39% of appointed members of the UC Board of Regents are women.
- Only two of nine undergraduate UC campuses are led by women.





CALIFORNIA STATE UNIVERSITY

The CSU system is known as "The People's University" and is the primary bachelors-degree-granting system in the state, serving 404,820 undergraduate students as of fall 2022, making it the largest four-year university system in the nation.¹³

The CSU's undergraduate population more closely mirrors the demographics of the state's younger population than does the UC's undergraduate population. System- and campus-level leadership, however, do not.

The undergraduate population at the CSU largely resembles California's population, but CSU leadership is still overwhelmingly white.

Figure 13. CSU Population by Race/Ethnicity (2021-2022).

Latinx Black and NHPI White 5% California Population Total (39 M) 39% 15% 35% California Population 18-24 (647,602) 49% 6% 13% 27% Undergraduate Population** (422,391) 47% 4% 16% 21% 13% 19% Board of Trustees (16) 31% 38% Chancellor's Office (7) 43% 0% 0% 57% Campus Senior Leadership (210) 16% 20% 10% 53% Tenured/Tenure-Track Faculty (10,373) 10% 4% 19% 54% Non-Tenure-Track Faculty (3,163) 12% 4% 11% 63% Recent Tenured/Tenure-Track Hires (3,780) 11% 14% 42% 6% 5% 57% Part-Time Faculty (14,400) 14% 13% 11% 11% 70% Academic Senate of the CSU (46) 9% Sum of Campus Senates (1,392) 12% 6% 17% 64%

5% 5% 9% 0% 0% 0% 6% 4% 18% 3% 0% 1%

Asian American

Unknown

0%

0% 3%

0%

0% 0%

6%

6%

9%

8%

0%

0%

*Native Hawajian and Pacific Islander

**Fall 2021 enrollment

Data Source: Data for population from US Census, undergraduate enrollment from system dashboards, faculty from IPEDS, other data from research team analyses

Note: This is Figure 6 in the full report

Nearly half (47%) of CSU students are Latinx, with solid Latinx representation at the Chancellor's Office level, and nearly one third (31%) of appointed trustees being Latinx. However, at individual CSU campuses, Latinx students have few opportunities to see themselves among campus-level leadership, where only 16% of total campus-level senior leaders are Latinx. In the classroom, meanwhile, the Latinx share of CSU tenured/tenure-track faculty remains at 10% as it was five years ago, and the share of non-tenured faculty who are Latinx has only grown from 10% to 12%.

Over 50% of campus leadership at the CSU is white despite only one in five students being white.

	Latinx	Black	Asian American and NHPI*	Other	Unknown	White
Board of Trustees	5	2	3			6
Chancellor's Office	3					4
Campus Leadership	33	43	22			112

Table 2. CSU Governing Bodies by Race/Ethnicity (2021-2022).

*Native Hawaiian and Pacific Islander Data Source: Data collected and analyzed by Campaign for College Opportunity researchers Note: This is Table 3 in the full report

More than half of CSU leadership at the campus and system levels are white, with nearly two-thirds of non-tenure track faculty and over half of tenured/tenure-track faculty being white.

Though the Black student population across CSU campuses is small, they are well represented in campus senior leadership and on the Board of Trustees; however, there is currently no Black representation among the executive members of the CSU Chancellor's Office. Asian American students also have no representation in the CSU Chancellor's Office.

Of the 10,373 CSU tenured and tenure-track faculty, there are only 451 Black, 1,048 Latinx, and 1,966 Asian American and NHPI professors.

The percentage of tenured/tenure-track CSU faculty who are Latinx, Black, Asian American and NHPI has grown modestly, but white faculty still account for the majority of CSU faculty.

Figure 14. Tenured/Tenure-Track Faculty at the CSU by Race/Ethnicity (2017-2021).



*Native Hawaiian and Pacific Islander Data Source: National Center for Education Statistics, Integrated Postsecondary Readiness System (IPEDS) Note: This is Figure 7 in the full report



Women at the CSU

Women are more equitably represented on CSU campuses. Women now make up 50% of CSU campus senior leadership, compared to 44% in 2017, and 56% of the appointed members of the Board of Trustees are currently women (nine of 16). Eleven of the 23 CSU campuses have female presidents, and in most spaces, we see gender parity across the CSU system. In fact, the percentage of tenured and tenure-track faculty who are women has grown slightly over the past five years, from 47% to 49%.

Women are more equitably represented across the CSU.

Figure 15. CSU Populations by Gender (2021-2022).

California Population (18-24)	51%	49%		
Undergraduate Students*	43%	57%		
Board of Trustees	44%	56%		
Chancellor's Office	57%	43%		
Campus Senior Leadership	50%	50%		
Tenured/Tenure-Track Faculty	51%	49%		
Non-Tenure-Track Faculty	44%	56%		
Recent Tenured/Tenure-Track Hires	46%	54%		
Part-Time Faculty	45%	55%		
Academic Senate of the CSU	52%	48%		
Sum of Campus Senates	47%	53%		
	Men Other/Unknown ⁺ W	/omen		

*Fall 2021 enrollment

Data Source: Data for population from US Census, undergraduate enrollment from system dashboards, faculty from IPEDS, other data from research team analyses

Note: This is Figure 8 in the full report

CSU BRIGHT SPOTS:

- The CSU student body is fairly reflective of the California young-adult population.
- Half of CSU campus presidents and senior leaders are women and the CSU made history in appointing Dr. Mildred Garcia as the first Latina Chancellor of the CSU in 2023.
- Over half of the CSU Board of Trustees are women and are more equitably represented across CSU leadership positions.

[†]Other/unknown includes nonbinary individuals and data not reported or unknown

CSU INCLUSION CHALLENGES:

- Latinx faculty account for only 10% of tenured/tenure-track faculty in the CSU.
- Only 4% of tenured/tenure-track faculty are Black.
- More than half of CSU leadership at the campus and system levels are white, with nearly two-thirds of non-tenure-track faculty and over half of tenured/tenure-track faculty being white.
- There is currently no representation of Black or Asian American and NHPI Californians among executive leadership in the CSU Chancellor's Office.
- Seventy percent of the statewide CSU academic senate body is white, while the sum of campus academic senate bodies is 64% white, similarly lacking inclusion and diversity reflective of the student body and California's population.





CALIFORNIA COMMUNITY COLLEGES

The California Community Colleges system is the largest higher education system in the world, educating nearly two million students.¹⁴

The racial/ethnic demographics of the state's community colleges broadly reflect those of the state's 18 to 24-year olds, with Latinx students accounting for nearly half (47%) of community college students. These students, however, have few opportunities to see themselves in their campus- and system-level leadership. Only three (25%) of the 12-member Board of Governors are Latinx, while only 29% of senior leaders in the Chancellor's Office are Latinx—**though this is more than double the Latinx representation (14%) we observed in 2017.**

Although Latinx students make up the biggest proportion of the student population at community college campuses (47%), only 20% of campus leaders and 18% of tenured/tenure-track faculty are Latinx.

	Latinx	Black	Asian Ameri and NHPI		Other	Unknown
California Population Total (39 M)	39%	5%	15%	35%	5%	0%
California Population 18-24 (647,602)	49%	6%	13%	27%	5%	0%
Undergraduate Population** (1,833,441)	47%	5%	14%	24%	4%	5%
Board of Governors (12)	25%	25%	8%	42%	0%	0%
Chancellor's Office (14)	29%	14%	21%	36%	0%	0%
District Leadership (465)	25%	9%	7%	59%	0%	0%
Campus Senior Leadership (565)	20%	16%	8%	53%	3%	0%
Tenured/Tenure-Track Faculty (17,582)	18%	6%	11%	56%	4%	5%
Non-Tenure-Track Faculty (1,302)	23%	6%	10% 📕	50%	4%	5%
Recent Tenured/Tenure-Track Hires (5,316)	20%	7%	10%	47%	4%	13%
Part-Time Faculty (36,530)	17%	6%	11%	55%	4%	7%
Academic Senate of the CCC (14)	14%	21%	7%	57%	0%	0%
Sum of Campus Senates (2,879)	17%	6%	9%	57%	2%	9%

Figure 16. California Community Colleges Populations by Race/Ethnicity (2021-2022).

*Native Hawaiian and Pacific Islander

**2021-2022 enrollment

Data Source: Data for population from US Census, undergraduate enrollment from system dashboards, faculty from IPEDS, other data from research team analyses Note: This is Figure 10 in the full report

As can be seen in Figure 16, 18% of tenured/tenure-track faculty and 23% of non-tenure-track faculty are Latinx. While this is a significantly small number of Latinx faculty for a system with 47% Latinx students, **these numbers are notable as they constitute increases from 15% and 13%, respectively, in the past five years.**



Whites are vastly overrepresented at the district trustee and campus leadership levels.

	Latinx	Black	Asian American and NHPI*	Other	Unknown	White
Board of Governors	3	3	1			5
Systemwide Chancellor's Office	5	2	3			4
District Trustees	115	42	34			274
Campus Leadership	112	93	49	3	7	301

Table 3. California Community Colleges Governing Bodies by Race/Ethnicity (2021-2022).

*Native Hawaiian and Pacific Islander

Data Source: Data collected and analyzed by Campaign for College Opportunity researchers Note: This is Table 5 in the full report

White students account for 24% of the student population, yet among California community college leadership, the majority of faculty and academic senate leaders are white. That said, **diverse representation has increased at the district trustee level**—previously 69% of district trustees were white, while today 59% are white.

Black students make up five percent of the community college student body, with three Black members on the Board of Governors (25%), and 14% of the Chancellor's Office executive leadership being Black (up from 10% in 2017). The Asian American and NHPI population of students is also well represented among the Chancellor's Office, accounting for 21% of executive leadership positions (up from seven percent in 2017).

Latinx, Black, Asian American and NHPI, and AIAN students account for 67% of community college students, but less than half of community college faculty share these students' backgrounds.

Figure 17. Tenured/Tenure-Track Faculty at the California Community Colleges by Race/Ethnicity (2017-2021).



Data Source: Data retrieved from the National Center for Education Statistics, Integrated Postsecondary Readiness System (IPEDS) Note: This is Figure 11 in the full report

Women at the California Community Colleges

Women make up more than half (55%) of all community college students and are well-represented in leadership and faculty positions. There is a near-even split in district leadership positions and within the campus senior leadership, and 10 of the 13 executive leaders at the Chancellor's Office are women.

Of 116 community college presidents, 50 (46%) were women in 2020-2021 —a number unchanged from 2017. In fact, the gender composition of community college faculty has remained constant over the past five years, with women continuing to make up 54% of tenured and tenure-track faculty.

Women are adequately represented across all California Community Colleges levels of leadership.

Figure 18. California Community Colleges Populations by Gender (2021-2022).



*2021-2022 enrollment

Data Source: Data for population from US Census, undergraduate enrollment from system dashboards, faculty from IPEDS, other data from research team analyses

Note: This is Figure 12 in the full report

CALIFORNIA COMMUNITY COLLEGES BRIGHT SPOTS:

- The undergraduate student body largely reflects the diversity of the state of California and its young adult population.
- Women are well represented across all levels of leadership, including among tenured and tenure-track faculty, campus senior leadership, district leadership and over twothirds of the leadership in the Chancellor's Office. Women also make up the majority of the appointments on the Board of Governors.

CALIFORNIA COMMUNITY COLLEGE INCLUSION CHALLENGES:

- Only 35% of tenured and tenure-track faculty are Latinx, Black, Asian American and NHPI despite a student body that is 66% Latinx, Black, Asian American and NHPI.
- Only 32% of academic senate members across the community colleges are Latinx, Black, Asian American and NHPI – with 57% of senators being white.
- Campus leadership and district leadership is still overwhelmingly white at 53% and 59%, respectively.

[†]Other/unknown includes nonbinary individuals and data not reported or unknown



CALIFORNIA STUDENT AID COMMISSION

The California Student Aid Commission (CSAC) administers \$3.5 billion annually for the state's financial aid programs and makes recommendations for streamlining and improving financial aid policies.

The executive staff, comprising CSAC's executive director, general counsel, deputy directors, and division chiefs, has three white members out of a total of seven (43%). Latinx members of the executive team comprise just under a third of the group (29%), including Executive Director Marlene Garcia, a Latina, who announced her <u>retirement</u> from the Commission staff, effective at the end of June 2024.

Latinx and Black students are well represented on the California Student Aid Commission, but Latinx students are underrepresented among the Commission's executive staff.

Figure 19. California Student Aid Commission and selected populations by Race/Ethnicity (2021-2022).

CA Population Total (39M)
CA Population 18-24 (647,602)
CA Public Undergraduates (2,486,361)
CA Student Aid Commission (13)
CSAC Executive Staff (7)

Latinx	Black	Asian Americ and NHPI*		Other	Unknown
39%	5%	15%	35%	5%	0%
49%	6%	13%	27%	5%	0%
45%	5%	16%	23%	6%	4%
38%	31%	15%	15%	0%	0%
29%	14%	14%	43%	0%	0%

*Native Hawaiian and Pacific Islander Data Source: Data for Population from US Census, enrollment data from individual system dashboards/data repositories, other data from research team analyses Note: This is Figure 14 in the full report

CSAC BRIGHT SPOTS:

• The Commission has strong representation of Black and white leaders on its body.

CSAC INCLUSION CHALLENGES:

- The Commission's staff does not have sufficient representation of Asian American and NHPI leaders.
- Latinx students are underrepresented on the Commission's executive staff, while white students are overrepresented.





RECOMMENDATIONS

If California's public colleges and universities are to be fully inclusive spaces for the students they enroll and serve, we must ensure that educators from all backgrounds—Latinx, Black, underrepresented Asian American and NHPI, AIAN, and women—are leaders and faculty at every campus in California.

The following recommendations are critical to ensuring the full inclusion and representation of Californians at our community colleges and universities. **We challenge our Governor and state leaders to do more** than just speak about the importance of inclusion and diversity in our state. We challenge college leaders to begin and end with what is best for students and to ensure that their campuses are inclusive and welcoming places that reflect the talent and diversity of the student body.



State Leaders

- Commit to a California higher education system that reflects the state's diversity at all levels, from system leadership to student body.
- Appoint Latinx, Black, Asian American and NHPI, and AIAN Californians to the UC Board of Regents, CSU Board of Trustees, and California Community Colleges Board of Governors to ensure these bodies represent the people of California.
- Ensure equitable representation of women across racial/ethnic categories at all levels of governance and leadership.

- Require colleges and universities to critically examine hiring practices for faculty, staff, and campus leadership and implement solutions to increase inclusion on campus, using tools like those designed by Bensimon & Associates 2022 to assist colleges who seek to <u>Redesign the Presidential Search Process for Racial Equity.</u>
- Require the UC, CSU, and California Community Colleges to submit a bi-annual analysis of leadership, faculty, and academic senate diversity by race/ethnicity and gender that includes goals for improving equity and inclusion.
- Establish statewide and campus-level goals with specific plans and milestones for closing equity gaps and increasing the representation of historically marginalized populations.



Campus Leaders

- The UC, the CSU, and the California Community Colleges should annually collect and publish data disaggregated by race/ethnicity and gender for campus leadership and academic senate positions.
- Governing boards need to prioritize the hiring of college presidents who are representative of the students they serve, and have the proven ability and cultural competency to lead/promote more equitable and inclusive college campuses.
- College presidents and senior leadership need to provide clear, unambiguous guidance to hiring committees about Proposition 209 compliance while ensuring an understanding for how to identify and recruit diverse applicants.
- College presidents and senior leadership need to review current hiring practices to prevent bias against recruiting and hiring a more diverse and culturally competent faculty with the demonstrated ability to ensure student success.
- College presidents should require diverse applicant pools and have the courage and leadership to start searches over again if the applicant pool for a position has not resulted in an adequate number of competitive candidates from diverse backgrounds.
- Campus hiring committees, including those for adjunct/temporary faculty, should be reflective of the diversity of California and be required to have unconscious bias training. Qualifications must value diversity and require candidates to demonstrate an ability to effectively improve student outcomes and a talent for working effectively with underrepresented populations.
- College presidents and senior leadership need to develop clear pathways to leadership and invest in leadership development opportunities to create a pipeline of staff from historically marginalized groups to enter into leadership positions.

CONCLUSION

Our public education systems are meant to serve and benefit all Californians, yet—as this report makes clear—not all of our state's residents are able to share in these academic riches. Black and Latinx students enrolling our state's public four-year university systems are afforded far too few opportunities to see faculty and leadership who share their backgrounds and perspectives. This continued lack of representation in our systems is holding those students back, and their struggle to succeed is holding our state back as well.

Our state is stronger, and our people are better served when we include Californians of all racial/ethnic backgrounds in our institutions and our society. We must make sure that our students see leaders who look like them, that junior faculty and aspiring college leaders have mentors who understand the path they have taken, and that California has an equitable and inclusive system of higher education.



READ THE FULL REPORT

REFERENCES

- Campaign for College Opportunity. (2022). Higher education in California: An introduction to the state's public colleges & universities. Los Angeles, CA: Author. Retrieved from: <u>https://collegecampaign.org/portfolio/higher-education-california-introduction-states-public-colleges-universities/</u>
- Bustillos, L.T. & Siqueiros, M. (2018). Left out: How exclusion in California's colleges and universities hurts our values, our students, and our economy. Los Angeles, CA: Campaign for College Opportunity. Retrieved from: <u>https://collegecampaign.org/portfolio/left-out-report/</u>
- Odle, T., Gottfried, M., Miller, T., & Andrews, R.J. (2022). Who's matched up? Access to same-race instructors in higher education. [Annenberg Institute EdWorkingPaper No. 22-681]. Retrieved from: <u>https://www.edworkingpapers.com/sites/</u> default/files/ai22-681.pdf
- 4. Fairlie, R. W., Hoffmann, F., & Oreopoulos, P. (2014). "A Community College Instructor Like Me: Race and Ethnicity Interactions in the Classroom." *American Economic Review*, 104(8): 2567-91.
- 5. Hagedorn, L. Chi, W., Cepeda, R.M. & McLain, M. (2007), "An Investigation of Critical Mass: The Role of Latino Representation in the Success of Urban Community College Students." *Research in Higher Education* 48(1).
- 6. ibid.
- Hunt, D.V., Dixon-Fyle, S., Huber, C., del Mar Martínez Márquez, M. Prince, S., & Thomas, A. (2023). *Diversity matters even more: The case for holistic impact*. McKinsey & Company. Retrieved from: <u>Diversity matters even more: The case for holistic impact | McKinsey</u>.
- Campaign for College Opportunity. (2022). *Higher education in California: An introduction to the state's public colleges* & universities. Los Angeles, CA: Author. Retrieved from: <u>https://collegecampaign.org/portfolio/higher-education-california-introduction-states-public-colleges-universities/</u>
- 9. Reddy, V. & Siqueiros, M. (2021). *The state of higher education for Latinx Californians*. Los Angeles, CA: Campaign for College Opportunity. Retrieved from: <u>https://collegecampaign.org/portfolio/2021-state-higher-education-latinx-californias/</u>
- Reddy, V., Lee, D., & Siqueiros, M. (2022). The state of higher education for Asian American, Native Hawaiian, and Pacific Islander Californians. Los Angeles, CA: Campaign for College Opportunity. Retrieved from: <u>https://collegecampaign.org/</u> portfolio/state-higher-education-asian-american-native-hawaiian-pacific-islander-californians/
- 11. Fall enrollment at a glance. (2023). University of California Information Center. Retrieved from: <u>https://www.universityofcalifornia.edu/about-us/information-center/fall-enrollment-glance</u>
- 12. Bensimon & Associates. (2022). Whiteness rules: Racial exclusion in becoming an American college president. [Report]. Retrieved from: <u>https://collegefutures.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/10/whiteness-rules-presidential-search_findings-report_final.pdf</u>
- Fast Facts About the CSU. (n.d.). The California State University Facts About the CSU. Retrieved from: <u>https://www.calstate.edu/csu-system/about-the-csu/facts-about-the-csu/Documents/facts2023.pdf</u>
- 14. Key Facts. (2023). California Community Colleges—About Us. Retrieved from: https://www.cccco.edu/About-Us/Key-Facts



LOS ANGELES OFFICE

1149 S. Hill Street, Ste. 925 Los Angeles, CA 90015 Tel: (213) 744-9434 Fax: (877) 207-3560

SACRAMENTO OFFICE

1512 14th Street Sacramento, CA 95814 Tel: (916) 443-1681 Fax: (916) 443-1682

WASHINGTON, D.C. OFFICE

1016 16th Street NW, Suite 100 Washington, D.C. 20036 Tel: (202) 293-2828

www.collegecampaign.org

facebook.com/collegecampaign

O X @CollegeOpp

SIGN UP FOR OUR NEWSLETTER bit.ly/CampaignActionNetwork

BOARD OF DIRECTORS

Thomas A. Saenz, Chair Edward C. Bush, Vice Chair Maria Anguiano, Treasurer J. Luke Wood, Secretary Brooke Armour Estela Mara Bensimon Lena Carew Mellissa E. Gallegos Paul Granillo Juan Sánchez Muñoz Maria Ott Julie Peller Reshma Shamasunder Joseph Villela Andy Wong