

STILL LEFT OUT:

How Exclusion In California's Colleges & Universities Continues To Hurt Our Values, Students, and Democracy

HIGHER EDUCATION LEADERS

"I deeply appreciate the Campaign for College Opportunity's commitment to uncovering the complexities in our educational landscape. While we applaud progress in faculty diversity, the stark reality remains: our colleges and universities are still predominantly white. The underrepresentation of Latinx faculty is disheartening, and the demographic mismatch hinders our students' potential. Advocating for diversity must go hand in hand with prioritizing equity-minded leadership, fostering inclusive environments that empower both faculty and students. It is crucial that our institutions authentically reflect the rich diversity of our state, ensuring every student can thrive and fulfill their academic aspirations."

Dra. Michelle Batista

President and Co-Founder, CCColegas Vice President of Student Services, Lake Tahoe Community College

"While the California community college system serves the largest, most diverse student body in higher education, racially minoritized individuals are largely left out of leadership and faculty roles. Latinx faculty members comprise just 18% of tenured/tenure-track positions, and of the 92 Hispanic-Serving (HSI) community colleges across the state, just over 25% are led by Hispanic/Latino/a presidents. This is a clear mismatch when nearly half of Californians between 18 to 24 years old are Latinx. When our students have fewer role models, advisors, and mentors who share their experiences, data shows that their pass rates and levels of completion decrease. We cannot allow the community college system to create inequities in the pipeline for future generations of leaders. We must commit to ensuring college leadership and faculty are reflective of the populations we serve."

Jose L. Fierro, DVM, Ph.D.

President, California Association of Latino Community College Trustees and Administrators (CALCCTA) President/Superintendent, Cerritos College



"There is endless talk about diversity and transformation, but our higher education system continues to fall short of educating minoritized students as well as it needs to. A contributing factor to racial inequality is that leaders, faculty, and others have yet to recognize that our institutions are not race neutral entities and it is time to abandon race neutral solutions."

Dr. Estela Mara Bensimon

Founder, Center for Urban Education Rossier School of Education, University of Southern California

"As a leader in higher education for the past 28 years, I have seen incremental changes in hiring practices even when the truth is shared regarding the benefits of diversifying the faculty & executive leadership. The response from the system to the initial version of Left Out report was significant. I hope this new version will be taken as a professional call out & it will result in a recognition that our inability to drastically move the needle is because there are "isms" in place--racism, sexism, classism that prevent progress. We should respond with bold actions - create intrasystem data sharing of all masters level graduates by discipline sorted by demographic data and a database of all K-12 teachers w masters degrees w an electronic job board and online resume/vitae template, utilize the prompts implemented in Cluster Hiring, which explore candidate experience in working with and supporting Black, Latinx, Asian Pacific Islander Desi American (APIDA), Native American Students. After seeing Still Left Out—I'm compelled to say, we know what to do, we just need to do it."

Dra. Cynthia Olivo President, Fullerton College Founder, CCColegas

"As the President of Asian Pacific Americans in Higher Education (APAHE) and a member of the Asian American and Native Hawaiian Pacific Islander (AANHPI) community, I believe and know that diverse representation in higher education leadership at every single level is core to creating inclusive and welcoming environments for all students. I am encouraged to see the growth in diverse leadership over the last five years, especially with nearly half of CSU and CCC presidents being women. BUT, we are not at parity yet. Still Left Outtells us that only eight percent of campus and district leaders are AANHPI, and only two UC chancellors are women.

We have a long way to go and we at APAHE are committed to increasing diverse leadership across our college and university systems and the findings in this report outline a clear benchmark for us to aim toward in the years to come. This report will add fuel to the momentum needed to launch forward real change."

> Dr. Rowena Tomaneng President, Asian Pacific Islanders in Higher Education (APAHE) * President, San Jose City College



STUDENTS

"Students need faculty and leadership who look like them, come from the same background as them, and who can motivate them. As we continue to preach and make strides to ensure the diversity of our higher education faculty and leadership, it is important to remember the impact they have on the next generation simply by existing in the positions they hold. Now more than ever, is the time to be bold and tackle the racial and gender inequities within our institution and embrace racial diversity and the perspectives/experiences that come with it."

> Celene Aridin President UC Student Association

Recognizing the intersection of identity needed in higher education leadership is essential to closing equity gaps in the CSU system. As a first-generation Afro-Indigenous Muslim, I look to see if the culture of equity and inclusion in policy can reach faculty and students such as myself, who are often the first and only in every space we occupy, the statistical anomaly. As I work alongside faculty and staff who have witnessed the remarkable transformation of the CSU system over the last 20 years, it is also disheartening to see persistent issues of exclusion hindering us from equitable diversity in college leadership and faculty positions as highlighted in Still Left Out. We must not be complacent, and we must push the boundaries of what "has always been". Our reflections on where we can do better will lead to the transformation of not just our educational system, but of generations of the underserved, the minoritized, and the underrepresented.

Autumn Alaniz-Wiggins

2023-24 Student Body President Chico State University

Students are, more than ever, aware of how the environments they learn in affect wellbeing and success. Ensuring that students are able to learn from people like them is essential to creating communities where students of color are able to thrive. Already, we are seeing changes within student populations and student leadership, it is more than time to match that with changes in faculty, staff, and systemwide leadership. If we are to truly embrace ideals of diversity and racial equity within higher education, we must see these positions as integral to long-term change.

> Vero Caveroegusquiza 2023-24 University Affairs Chair UC Student Association



"Diversity in education is what allows us to learn from each other's experiences and hear stories uniquely different from our own. Diversity is what will push academia towards the attainment of a brighter future for all."

Carlos Rodriguez

Transfer Student, University of California, Los Angeles 2022-23 Student Body President, Porterville College

"As a product of the Cal State and Community College systems, I am encouraged by the progress that has been made across higher education, especially at the CSU, to increase the share of women and Black, Latinx, Native American and AAPI representation in faculty and college senior leadership positions. However, there is still substantial progress needed until the diversity of our student communities is truly reflected through more intentional appointments, hiring and tenure-track processes. When our leaders and educators look like the students they serve, it can have a transformational impact on empowering equitable student success."

Maria Linares

Alumna, California State University, Fullerton Student Trustee Emerita, 2021-23, California State University

HIGHER EDUCATION ADVOCATES

"Diversity and representation at every level are fundamental to inclusion and belonging for California's college students. Students want to be in college campuses where faculty, staff, and administrators not only look like them, but truly understand their backgrounds and experiences. The **Still Left Out** report provides us with insight on what California can do to create more inclusive college experiences for systematically excluded students."

Marcos Montes

Policy Director Southern California College Attainment Network (SoCal CAN)

"*Still Left Out* tells us what we have known for far too long – Black Latinx, Asian American, Native Hawaiian, and Pacific Islander communities continue to be significantly underrepresented throughout all levels of campus leadership, faculty, and administration. EdTrust-West is deeply committed to uplifting diverse and culturally inclusive hiring practices and curriculum at all levels, and we underscore this report's call for our systems to commit to the hard, but timely, work of ensuring proper representation across all three public university systems."

Dr. Christopher J. Nellum Executive Director The Education Trust-West



"Building power in our communities begins with creating space for diverse and equitable representation across the Birth to Twelfth Grade system, including higher education. *Still Left Out* calls on our higher education institutions and state leaders to take a serious look at who is making decisions about our students, who is leading our students, and how we are intentionally educating and supporting our students in culturally and linguistically affirming relevant manners. As an organization committed to catalyzing action that dismantles the systemic barriers that perpetuate disparities in our communities, we look forward to seeing put into practice innovative solutions in all schools to remove implicit biases in hiring processes, to uplift Black, Latinx, Asian American, and Native Hawaiian, Pacific Islander leaders, to create a racially just and equitable education for all."

Jessenia Reyes

Director of Educational Equity Catalyst California

"While we acknowledge the tremendous progress at CCC, CSU, and UC since 2017 to hire more Latinx, Black, Asian American and NHPI, and AIAN faculty and leaders, this report clearly shows that more needs to be done before our state's college campuses reflect California's rich student diversity. Research has clearly shown that students of color see meaningful educational benefits when they are exposed to teachers, instructors, and administrators who look like them and share their lived experiences. TICAS is committed to working with our institutional leaders, policymakers, and advocacy partners to close persistent equity gaps by race and income in college access and completion, as well as college affordability. Closing these gaps will help drive the more diverse higher education workforce that a flourishing, dynamic California needs well into the future."

Manny Rodriguez

Director of Policy, California The Institute for College Access and Success (TICAS)

"In the vibrant tapestry of California's educational landscape, the under representation of women, especially women of color on the governing boards of our university commissions, echoes a dissonance that urgently needs resolution. Despite comprising 54% of college students, women remain notably absent from key pillars of academic leadership – from tenured faculty to executive roles. To fortify the future of our university system, it is imperative that we not only address this gender disparity but also cultivate a strategic, long-term plan to broaden the spectrum of People of Color pursuing careers in academia. The current landscape, where males dominate UC Regents, CSU Trustees, and Community College Board of Governors, necessitates a proactive commitment to inclusivity, ensuring that the voices shaping our educational trajectory mirror the diverse faces of the students they serve. The inclusivity ensuring that the voices of shaping our education trajectory mirror the diverse faces of students they serve."

> Helen Torres Chief Executive Officer Hispaňas Organized for Political Equality (HOPE)

